FINAL EVALUATION

WELCOMED THROUGH WORK PROJECT

2019 – 2021
MY EXPECTATIONS ARE: TO HAVE MY FAMILY WITH ME AND, TO ACHIEVE THIS, I HAVE TO DEDICATE MYSELF TO MY STUDIES, I HOPE TO BECOME A GREAT PROFESSIONAL AND STUDY TOURISM AT A UNIVERSITY, AND I WANT TO LEARN MORE LANGUAGES AND ALSO BE ABLE TO TEACH OTHERS. WITH GOD’S HELP, I WILL MAKE IT!

Anabel Torres Sotillo shares her wishes for a new life in the city.

Welcoming dynamics, held in Brasilia/DF.

AVSI Brasil is a Brazilian non-profit organization founded in 2007 that acts in accordance with the AVSI Foundation, its reference entity. We operate in 12 territories (11 states and the Federal District) and are supported by over 550 employees. Through cross-sector alliances, we have implemented 31 projects to meet the human needs of vulnerable Brazilians, as well as Venezuelan migrants and refugees.

Over the past five years, more than 700,000 Venezuelans have come to Brazil in search of a new start. Since the creation of Operation Welcome, led by the federal government and supported by federal agencies, The United Nations (UN), international organizations, civil society organizations and the private sector, Venezuelan migrants and refugees here have received emergency shelter, legal and physical protection, capacity building to achieve autonomy and support for local integration.

In this context, the Welcomed through work project was launched in 2019 to support the efforts of Operation Welcome, which is guided by four key words: welcome, protect, promote and integrate.

We are therefore pleased to share this evaluation report carried out by Pólis Pesquisa on the first implementation phase of the project, which took place between 2019 and 2021. Fortunately, thanks to a new round of funding from the U.S. State Department’s Bureau of Population, Refugees, and Migration (PRM), the initiative has continued and will run through 2023. Through a scalable model and collaboration with multiple sectors, the Welcomed through work project has supported the voluntary relocation (“interiorization”) of more than 2,000 Venezuelans in its three years of implementation, with 1,000 individuals officially hired by the private sector; 95 interiorization processes were carried out in eight Brazilian states and the Federal District; 467 homes were secured in host cities; 35 professionals, including social workers and psychologists, accompanied families in their new homes; and 16 preparation and professionalization courses were offered, with 1,934 certificates issued to Venezuelans.

Thais Braga
Manager of the WELCOMED THROUGH WORK PROJECT
1. INTRODUCTION

IN 2018, THE BRAZILIAN GOVERNMENT LAUNCHED OPERATION WELCOME (OPERAÇÃO ACOlhIDA, IN PORTUGUESE) IN RESPONSE TO THE HUMANITARIAN EMERGENCY IN VENEZUELA. THE GOAL IS TO WELCOME VENEZUELAN MIGRANTS AND REFUGEES AND PROVIDE EMERGENCY ASSISTANCE TO PEOPLE IN PARTICULARLY VULNERABLE SITUATIONS.

The state of Roraima, the main entry point for Venezuelan immigrants in Brazil, has emergency shelters to accommodate them. The Federal Ministry of Citizenship, responsible for managing these facilities, signed a cooperation agreement with the UN Refugee Agency (UNHCR). The Brazilian Armed Forces provide operational and logistical coordination of all shelters under the Federal Subcommittee for Reception guidelines. Other UN agencies and civil society organizations also support the shelters. The Association for Volunteers in International Service (AVSI Brasil) manages five shelters, all in Roraima, under a partnership with UNHCR.

Four months after starting operations in Roraima, AVSI Brasil expanded its activities and developed a pilot project with Industrias São Miguel, a soft-drink company with a factory in Bahia, to formally hire Venezuelans there. This partnership aimed to integrate Venezuelan migrants and refugees into the labor market and support the social integration of their families in the state, in line with the interiorization through Employment Services (VES, in Portuguese) strategy of Operation Welcome. The experience was successful and prompted the AVSI Foundation, AVSI-USA, and AVSI Brasil - with the participation of the Migration and Human Rights Institute (IMDH), UNHCR, and the Brazilian federal government - to systematize a follow-up model in partnership with the public and private sectors and civil society to implement a project that reduces the social vulnerability of Venezuelan migrants and refugees in Brazil and supports a segment of the Brazilian population that faces economic and social vulnerability, while promoting peaceful coexistence between the two groups and nationalities. The model - embodied by the Welcomed through work project (Acolhidos por meio do trabalho, in Portuguese) - has been recognized by the United States government. As a result, the U.S. Department of State’s Bureau of Population, Refugees, and Migration (PRM) granted financial support to implement the activities between 2019 and 2021. Due to the good results, the funding was extended for another two years between 2021 and 2023.

This document presents the results of the Welcomed through work project for the period between 2019 and 2021, based on the logical framework of the initiative, including evaluating the project’s impact on the direct beneficiaries (Venezuelan migrants and refugees and vulnerable Brazilians). It also critically evaluates the experience and systematizes the valuable elements to lay the groundwork for similar future interventions and bring the initiative into the debate on refugee and migrant integration in Brazil.

2. THE WELCOMED THROUGH WORK PROJECT

2.1 A BRIEF DESCRIPTION

In the context of the humanitarian crisis in Venezuela, families often arrive in Brazil with only their clothes. They are then received in emergency shelters in Roraima, a state that offers few employment opportunities due to its historical and economic realities. Migrant families welcomed in the temporary sheltering centers of Roraima have a hard time entering the formal labor market, according to a quantitative survey conducted by AVSI Brasil and UNHCR in the shelters of Boa Vista, the state capital, in December 2019. The geographic remoteness of Roraima compared to other Brazilian states presents another challenge: the need for transportation, usually very costly for the Venezuelans, to other parts of Brazil that have more job opportunities.

Roraima: Families move from the BR8 reception center in Pacaraima towards Boa Vista.

Thus, the Welcomed through work project provides migrants and refugees free access to Portuguese language courses, vocational training, and job preparation in the shelters managed by AVSI Brasil in Boa Vista (RR), increasing their chances of entering the labor market and achieving social integration in Brazil. It is also important to highlight that through the interiorization strategy of Operation Welcome, the project also acts inter-institutionally, seeking partnerships with companies throughout Brazil interested in hiring Venezuelans willing to be interiorized through the VES modality. Within a unique institutional approach (the most comprehensive currently implemented in the country), AVSI Brasil guides the voluntary resettlement at all stages to the city where the company is located: 1) Pre-interiorization in Boa Vista; 2) reception upon arrival; 3) follow-up during settlement in the city, where families who have already found a job according to the Brazilian Labor Consolidation Laws (CLT, in Portuguese) are placed in furnished properties, rented by the project for up to three months. During this time, the project’s social assistance helps them enroll their children in schools, access the Brazilian Unified Health System (SUS, in Portuguese), and receive government social benefits. In addition, it also mediates any problems with the contracting company, and each family group receives financial support in the form of a food card (the total amount granted varies between R$400 and R$900, depending on the size of the family group), as well as a food parcel and cleaning supplies during the first month.

In this way, the Welcome Through Work project not only helps overcome the challenge of geographic isolation but also supports Venezuelans seeking work in other parts of the country. It begins by offering vocational qualification opportunities, Portuguese courses, and job preparation in the shelters in Boa Vista (RR). It includes the nomination of interested candidates for the contracting partner company to promote recruitment; monitoring, support, and advice in obtaining the necessary documents and health protocols for the interiorization process; it oversees flight and ticket planning - carried out by Operation Welcome with financial support from the Brazilian federal government and the International Organization for Migration (IOM); structured support in the destination city where the contract worker and their family will be relocated, with accommodation, food, and personal social assistance. This initiative requires institutional partnerships at the starting point, in Boa Vista, and at the destination. Both the contracting companies and the municipal authorities must be coordinated, and all parties must be in constant dialogue so that these families can benefit from the social services to which they are entitled. In other words, the project aims to promote integration into Brazilian society through a path that prioritizes the achievement of autonomy.
2.2 INDICATORS AND QUANTITATIVE RESULTS FROM 2019 TO 2021

Even though the Welcomed through work project was severely affected in 2020 and 2021 by the Covid 19 pandemic, the initiative has exceeded most of the quantitative goals proposed for beneficiaries. The objectives that were not achieved were mainly related to mobilizing society and raising awareness of the project, which is justified by the context of social distancing necessary to cope with the pandemic.

The indicators and quantitative results achieved are listed below.

**THE INITIATIVE EXCEEDED MOST OF THE QUANTITATIVE OBJECTIVES PROPOSED FOR THE BENEFICIARY POPULATIONS.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>OBJECTIVE 1</th>
<th>Improve access to formal employment for Venezuelan migrants and refugees and the vulnerable Brazilian population</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>OBJECTIVE 2</td>
<td>Facilitate the socioeconomic integration of the Venezuelan population welcomed in Boa Vista and Pacaraima through voluntary relocation (“interiorization”) to other Brazilian cities</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>INDICATOR 1</th>
<th>Number of refugees and migrants who benefit from Portuguese language and vocational training courses (for those going through the interiorization process and those seeking employment in Roraima)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>INDICATOR 2</td>
<td>Number of refugees and migrants who receive vocational skills certification</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INDICATOR 4</td>
<td>Number of people contacted through outreach campaigns with the private and public sector, business associations, and NGOs to mobilize society around the Interiorization for Work initiative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INDICATOR 5</td>
<td>Number of formal job placements made for Venezuelan migrants and refugees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INDICATOR 7</td>
<td>Number of Venezuelans hired through the project who remain employed after a three-month probationary period</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INDICATOR 1</td>
<td>Number of people accommodated and receiving social assistance post-relocation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INDICATOR 2</td>
<td>Number of people involved in local awareness-raising activities in the host community</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INDICATOR 3</td>
<td>Number of volunteers involved with the project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INDICATOR 4</td>
<td>Number of relocated workers expressing high level of satisfaction with relocation in host community, three months after relocation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3 The information was reported to Polis Pesquisa by AVSI Brasil’s project management team.

4 All courses were conducted by the National Commercial Learning Service (Serviço Nacional de Aprendizagem Comercial - Senac) of Roraima.
3. METHODOLOGICAL DESCRIPTION

This paper describes the evaluation of the effects of the Welcomed through work project on 3 distinct populations, which were addressed in combined and independent research designs.

TARGET GROUP 1
Venezuelan migrants and refugees voluntarily interiorized through work on their journey to Brazil, in collaboration with AVSI Brasil through Operation Welcome.

TARGET GROUP 2
Project partner companies that, with the support of AVSI Brasil, have opened job opportunities in different cities in Brazil for Venezuelan migrants and refugees.

TARGET GROUP 3
Venezuelan migrants and refugees benefited from Portuguese, work preparation and vocational courses given by AVSI Brasil, in the shelter in the city of Boa Vista, state of Roraima.

QUANTITATIVE AND QUALITATIVE METHODS, IN COMBINATION, FOR PRIMARY DATA COLLECTION FOR THIS RESEARCH PROJECT

Evaluation of the effects of the interiorization pillar of the project Welcomed through work
- 1 survey
- 12 in-depth interviews for the combined analysis of the collected data.
- Data collection: 07/01/2021 to 08/26/2021

Evaluation of the Portuguese language and professional qualification courses conducted by AVSI in the Boa Vista shelters
- 1 survey
- 4 in-depth interviews to support the construction of this instrument
- Data collection: 02/08/2021 to 20/08/2021
For the evaluation of target groups 1 and 3 described above, two quantitati- ve field studies were conducted using the survey method in combination with 16 in-depth interviews.

The questionnaires were applied in a digital environment in Portuguese (Brazilian target group) and Spanish (Venezuelan target group). The ques- tionnaires designed for the two surveys were pre-tested to verify the quality, scope, and understanding of the ques- tions by the evaluation target group. All questionnaires included an Informed Consent Form (ICF) for participation in the survey.

In the interiorization evaluation, the research questionnaire and the identifi- cation of key variables to measure the integration of migrants and refu- gees into Brazilian society were based on data collected in four in-depth in- terviews with two contact points for family arrangements of Venezuelan migrants and refugees in the region of origin (Boa Vista) and with two other contact points for family arrangements in the destination region, which the Welcome Project interiorized over three months as part of its work in the cities of Seara (SC) and Porto Alegre (RS).

Of the 16 interviews, 12 aimed to assess the impact of the Interiorization Program pillar of the Welcomed through work project in relation to the autonomy of Venezuelan migrants and refugees. The other four were conducted to support the creation of questionnaires for the evaluation of courses for Venezuelan migrants and refugees.

The secondary data were used to sys- tematize the statistics on Venezuelan migrants and refugees interiorized through the VES modality with the sup- port of the project. All this was done from the point of view of professional qualification and social and psychologi- cal support, as well as placement in companies, according to the methodo- logy developed by AVSI Brasil.

### DESCRIPTIVE TABLE WITH INFORMATION ABOUT THE IN-DEPTH INTERVIEWS (IDI)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of interviews</th>
<th>Interview Profile (IDI)</th>
<th>Completion date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Man, 45 years old, college degree, in Boa Vista, waiting for interiorization – IDI-11</td>
<td>07/26/2021</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Woman, 42, high school educated, in Boa Vista, waiting for interiorization – IDI-12</td>
<td>07/27/2021</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Man, 29, high school educated, Porto Alegre, 5 months after interiorization through the project – IDI-5</td>
<td>07/02/2021</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Man, 58, high school educated, interiorized 11 months before, Seara/ SC – IDI-6</td>
<td>07/09/2021</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>AVSI Brasil’s key players</td>
<td>07/01/2021</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Professional responsible for welcoming at the destination of the interiorization – IDI-1</td>
<td>07/01/2021</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Professional working in the administration of the Welcomed through work project – IDI-4</td>
<td>07/12/2021</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Project partner companies that hire migrants and refugees through the Job Placement Modality (VES) - Human Resources department heads</td>
<td>13/08/2021</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Animal protein agro-industry (Seara/ SC) – IDI-7</td>
<td>08/25/2021</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Furniture industry (Concórdia/ SC) – IDI-8</td>
<td>08/25/2021</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Animal protein agro-industry (Videira/ SC) – IDI-9</td>
<td>08/17/2021</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Food trade (DF) – IDI-10</td>
<td>07/01/2021</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>UNHCR key player</td>
<td>07/01/2021</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Professionals involved in the interiorization and welfare program – IDI-2</td>
<td>08/04/2021</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Operation Welcome key player</td>
<td>08/04/2021</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Responsible for shelter security, food, health, infrastructure and logistics, and coordination and management of the interiorization program – IDI-3</td>
<td>08/04/2021</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4. MAIN ANALYSES

4.1. TARGET GROUP 1: REFUGEES AND VENEZUELAN MIGRANTS VOLUNTARILY INTERIORIZED THROUGH WORK, WITH AVSI BRASIL’S COLLABORATION, VIA OPERATION WELCOME

4.1.1. SAMPLE PLANNING

In planning the sample for this study, 208 respondents (n=208) were selected, encompassing three analytic categories (Phase 0, 1 and 2). Respondents were adult heads of households from selected family arrangements, with one person per family arrangement.

ANALYTICAL CATEGORIES OF THIS RESEARCH ASSOCIATED WITH THREE PHASES OF THE AVSI PROJECT, WELCOMED THROUGH WORK, WITHIN THE FRAMEWORK OF OPERATION WELCOME

SAMPLE PERCENTAGE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PHASE</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Sample Percentage</th>
<th>n</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PHASE 0</td>
<td>Shelter waiting for interiorization in Boa Vista</td>
<td>26.4%</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PHASE 1</td>
<td>Up to three months after arrival in the destination city, a period during which they are supported by AVSI’s Welcome through work project</td>
<td>26.4%</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PHASE 2</td>
<td>After the end of social assistance provided by AVSI under the project Welcome through work</td>
<td>47.2%</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Roraima: Families landing in Boa Vista.
In Phase 0 (P0), we interviewed 55 individuals sheltered in the Boa Vista (RS), São Miguel do Oeste (SC), and Concórdia (SC).

In Phase 1 (P1), we interviewed 55 individuals in three cities: Caxias do Sul (RS), São Miguel do Oeste (SC), and Concórdia (SC).

In Phase 2 (P2), we interviewed 98 people in 18 cities: Arabutã, Arvoredo, Blumenau, Chapadão, Itá, Ipiranga, Irani, Londrina do Sul, Seara, Xanxerê, and Xaxim, all in Santa Catarina State; Barraçao, Curitiba, Maringá, and Rolândia, in Paraná State; São Paulo (SP); and Vitória (ES).

The confidence level of the results is over 95%, indicating that the conclusions drawn from these results have a high probability of being accurate.

### 4.1.2. Respondents’ Profile

#### Arrival in Brazil

The interviewed group arrived in Brazil between 2017 and 2021. Most of them arrived in 2019 or later.

#### Sociodemographic profile

**Gender, age, skin color, or race**

On average, 56.7% of respondents are male and 43.3% are female. Comparing P0 to P2, there are more male than female respondents in P2.

Most respondents (31.3%) are in the 30-39 age group. Venezuelans between 25-29 years old are in second place with 23.1%. Respondents between 40-49 years old are in third place with 20.7%. Followed by young people between 18 and 24 years old with 17.8%. Only 5.3% of respondents are over the age of 50, and 1.9% did not indicate their age.

#### Education and professional experience

Most of the respondents have a high school diploma (46.2%) and a specialized high school or higher vocational education (26.9%). In these cases, most work experience is in management, electrical engineering, IT, mechanics, nursing, education, accounting, agronomy, and occupational safety. Of those with education up to high school, most are in food service and as construction helpers or bricklayers.

### 4.1.3 Results from Three Analytical Dimensions

The results of the study on the impact of the project on the autonomy of Venezuelan migrants and refugees interiorized in the VES are reflected in three analytical aspects: economy, access to fundamental rights, and social capital.

Regarding the economic aspect, the key variables are employability, family income, and the gap between family income and what is considered necessary for family subsistence in Brazil. The continuous variable related to family income (dependent variable) was explained in a linear regression model that included as one of the explanatory variables (independent) the timing of the interiorization process, a marker of the interiorization modalities of “social reunification” and “family reunification”.

Family arrangements and household density Most respondents reported living in a two-parent family (57.2%) or a single-parent family (14.4%), as shown in the figure below. The family types have an average of 3.9 members. 25% have two people, 50% have up to 4 people, and 25% have between 5 and 16 people (the highest value in the distribution).

Of the families with two or only one parent, on average, 36.1% have children aged 0 to 3, 21.6% have children aged 4 to 5, and 49% have children aged 6 to 17.

There is a tendency for the average family density to be higher after interiorization and the period of social accompaniment than when the family left Boa Vista, with an average of 4.2 members.

This is because, once settled in the interiorization destination, Venezuelans encourage their family and friends to join them, often through the interiorization modalities of “social reunification” and “family reunification”.

#### Education level

- 1.9% Did not attend school
- 20.7% Middle school or lower
- 46.2% High school or lower
- 26.9% Vocational training (higher education) or high school with integrated vocational training
- 4.3% College degree

### 4.1.4. Respondents’ Profile

#### Arrival in Brazil

The interviewed group arrived in Brazil between 2017 and 2021. Most of them arrived in 2019 or later.

#### Sociodemographic profile

**Gender, age, skin color, or race**

On average, 56.7% of respondents are male and 43.3% are female. Comparing P0 to P2, there are more male than female respondents in P2.

Most respondents (31.3%) are in the 30-39 age group. Venezuelans between 25-29 years old are in second place with 23.1%. Respondents between 40-49 years old are in third place with 20.7%. Followed by young people between 18 and 24 years old with 17.8%. Only 5.3% of respondents are over the age of 50, and 1.9% did not indicate their age.

#### Education and professional experience

Most of the respondents have a high school diploma (46.2%) and a specialized high school or higher vocational education (26.9%). In these cases, most work experience is in management, electrical engineering, IT, mechanics, nursing, education, accounting, agronomy, and occupational safety. Of those with education up to high school, most are in food service and as construction helpers or bricklayers.
For the fundamental rights aspect, the variables considered were housing autonomy, access to health, education (children and youth), and government social programs for the most vulnerable.

For the social capital aspect, the following variables were considered: Relationships (socialization), ease of making new friends, satisfaction with life in Brazil, and happiness.

For the latter two aspects, the statistical technique of Principal Component Analysis (PCA) was applied, which reduces the dimensionality of the set of original variables observed in each dimension and generates one or more indicators that optimally calculate the weight of each original variable involved. Once the indicator (or indicators) are constructed, the impact of time on the autonomy pathway is determined.

To evaluate the impact of the Welcomed Through Work project on the interiorization process and the achievement of autonomy, we analyzed indicators of the three dimensions over time (P0, P1 and P2).

Regarding the economic aspect, a strong relationship was found between employability and interiorization in the economic field. In Boa Vista (RR), formal employment is a rare exception for migrants and refugees (1.8%), and 27.3% of respondents are unemployed, while in P2 these figures reach 77.6% and 14.3%, respectively. It is worth noting that the latter rate is close to the national average.

The increase in employability, family income and number of employed family members is also significant when comparing P2 and P0. The gap between actual family income and projected family income for family subsistence narrows (Figure 9), with ¼ of the interiorized families in P2 earning a family income above the amount they report as necessary for their subsistence (2.5 thousand reais on average across the three phases).

REGRESSION MODEL VARIABLES AND THEIR COEFFICIENTS WITH EFFECT ON THE DEPENDENT VARIABLE “FAMILY INCOME”.

In addition, it is important to note that in the family arrangements in the categories “two parents” and “couple without children” – which include a total of 134 cases in the sample – the proportion in which only one person works decreased from 65.8% to 35.7% between P1 and P2. At the same time, the share of family arrangements in which two or more people work increases from 34.2% to 58.9%. This increase can be explained by the integration of women into the formal labor market when they leave the domestic sphere to support their families.

The freedom of choice also changes over time. While in P0 85.5% of respondents think that their families must accept any job, in P2 56.1% think that they can choose better job opportunities now.

To investigate the relationship between the interiorization process of Venezuelan migrants and refugees in Brazil and family income, we built a linear regression model with the total income of the families surveyed as the dependent variable. The following variables of interest were kept under control in this analysis:

• Phase: P0, P1 and P2.
• The number of employed persons in the respondent’s family.
• Duration of residence in Brazil.
• Biological sex.
• Age.
• Education.
The model underscores the importance of the Interiorization program: statistically, the time variable (in months) by itself has no significant effect on family income in Brazil. Overall, however, the model shows that the impact does not stop when social follow-up ends at P1 for those who participated in the Welcomed through work project. High levels of employability remain in family arrangements, and incomes increase as more people in the family-including women who previously worked in the household-enter the labor market.

Regarding access to fundamental rights, P2 finds that 100% of families live in their own (76.5%) or shared (23.5%) housing. The good evaluation of access to health care in P0 stands out here. This shows the universality of the Unified Health System (SUS) in Brazil, which is further developed in P2, as well as the access to social programs offered by the government.

About education, although more children and young people from interiorized families attend school in P2 than in P0 and P1, there are still families with school-age children who do not attend school-15.2% have not enrolled any of their children and 28.3% have enrolled at least one of their children. In this regard, it should be noted that not all schools had resumed operations in the reporting month of this study due to the Covid 19 pandemic. Despite the possibility of distance learning, it is difficult for children and young people to find suitable places to learn where they live. They also have difficulty accessing the internet and devices such as cell phones and tablets, a problem that also occurs among young Brazilians, especially public-school students. In addition, there are barriers imposed by educational institutions - which can be understood as a subtle form of discrimination - that make it difficult for Venezuelan children and young people of school age (between 6 and 18 years old) to have their documents recognized and thus enroll.

### EVALUATION OF ACCESS TO PUBLIC HEALTH CARE

- **Great**
  - PHASE 0: 38.5%
  - PHASE 1: 54.2%
  - PHASE 2: 52.6%

- **Good**
  - PHASE 0: 10.6%
  - PHASE 1: 33.3%
  - PHASE 2: 44.3%

- **Regular**
  - PHASE 0: 11.5%

- **Bad**
  - PHASE 0: 40.4%
  - PHASE 1: 10.4%
  - PHASE 2: 3.1%

### EVALUATION OF ACCESS TO SOCIAL PROGRAMS

- **Great**
  - PHASE 0: 18.2%
  - PHASE 1: 30.6%
  - PHASE 2: 42.9%

- **Good**
  - PHASE 0: 91.5%
  - PHASE 1: 61.9%
  - PHASE 2: 48.4%

- **Regular**
  - PHASE 0: 24.2%
  - PHASE 1: 18.6%
  - PHASE 2: 8.8%

- **Bad**
  - PHASE 0: 6.1%

### ACCESS OF 4 TO 5-YEAR-OLD CHILDREN TO PRESCHOOL ACCORDING TO THE PHASE OF THE INTERIORIZATION PROCESS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>PHASE 0</th>
<th>PHASE 1</th>
<th>PHASE 2</th>
<th>TOTAL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>All children are in school</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>n</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>%</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
<td>23.5%</td>
<td>69.2%</td>
<td>29.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At least one of the children is in school</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>n</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>%</td>
<td>28.6%</td>
<td>17.6%</td>
<td>7.7%</td>
<td>18.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>None of the children are in school</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>n</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>%</td>
<td>71.4%</td>
<td>58.8%</td>
<td>21.3%</td>
<td>52.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>n</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>%</td>
<td>100.0%</td>
<td>100.0%</td>
<td>100.0%</td>
<td>100.0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### ACCESS OF 6 TO 17-YEAR-OLD CHILDREN TO PRESCHOOL ACCORDING TO THE PHASE OF THE INTERIORIZATION PROCESS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>PHASE 0</th>
<th>PHASE 1</th>
<th>PHASE 2</th>
<th>TOTAL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>All children are in school</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>n</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>%</td>
<td>25.0%</td>
<td>37.5%</td>
<td>56.5%</td>
<td>42.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At least one of the children is in school</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>n</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>%</td>
<td>34.4%</td>
<td>8.3%</td>
<td>28.3%</td>
<td>25.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>None of the children are in school</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>n</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>%</td>
<td>40.6%</td>
<td>54.2%</td>
<td>15.2%</td>
<td>32.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>n</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>%</td>
<td>100.0%</td>
<td>100.0%</td>
<td>100.0%</td>
<td>100.0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Finally, beneficiaries commented on the evaluation of the interiorization program. In P2, at the end of the three-month social support, the project received 96.1% positive evaluations, with 68.6% of respondents describing it as “great” and 27.5% as “good.” They rated the course as positive (n=147) and confirmed that the interiorization supported by the Welcomed through work project was worthwhile and that they would do it again.

To assess the satisfaction, quality of life and happiness of Venezuelan migrants and refugees in Brazil, a “well-being” scale was created, ranging from 0 to 10 using factor analysis. In the P1 phase, when they are resettled, migrants and refugees score the highest on this scale. It is the only indicator that does not show a significant increase over the course of interiorization between P0 and P2 - the conditions they face due to migration could be the reason.

To assess the satisfaction, quality of life and happiness of Venezuelan migrants and refugees in Brazil, a “well-being” scale was created, ranging from 0 to 10 using factor analysis. In the P1 phase, when they are resettled, migrants and refugees score the highest on this scale. It is the only indicator that does not show a significant increase over the course of interiorization between P0 and P2 - the conditions they face due to migration could be the reason.

**Likert Scale of Evaluation of the Welcomed Through Work Project, Applied in P2 to the Participants of This Research**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>REGULAR</th>
<th>GOOD</th>
<th>GREAT</th>
<th>CANNOT EVALUATE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>27.5%</td>
<td>68.6%</td>
<td>6.9%</td>
<td>1.3%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**COMPANY**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>COMPANY</th>
<th>CITY/STATE</th>
<th>INTERVIEW DATE</th>
<th>NUMBER OF VENEZUELANs HIRED</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Animal protein</td>
<td>Seara (SC)</td>
<td>08/13/2021</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>agro-industry</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Furniture Industry</td>
<td>Concórdia (SC)</td>
<td>08/25/2021</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Animal protein</td>
<td>Videira (SC)</td>
<td>08/25/2021</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>agro-industry</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Food trade</td>
<td>Brasília (DF)</td>
<td>08/17/2021</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**4.2. TARGET GROUP 2: COMPANIES THAT HAVE HIRED VENEZUELAN MIGRANTS AND REFUGEES IN SEVERAL BRAZILIAN CITIES**

**4.2.1. SAMPLE PLANNING**

We used two criteria to select the companies to be interviewed in this research. The first considered those that hired a larger number of Venezuelan migrants and refugees through the project; the second criterion aimed to diversify the location of the sample, since most of the hiring companies are in the south of Brazil. For this reason, we included Brasília (DF) as well. Thus, representatives of four partner companies of the project were interviewed as follows:

Santa Catarina: Emilse was interiorized with her husband, who was hired to work in a furniture factory in Concórdia.

Distrito Federal: Antzabeds was interiorized with her family to Brasília to work in a fast-food company.
4.2.2. HIRING PROFILE AND COMPANY PERSPECTIVE

In the four hiring companies that participated in the survey through in-depth interviews, the average retention rate after the 90-day probationary period is between 50% and 75% - a percentage very similar to the statistics for other employed nationalities.

Salaries offered range from R$1,190 to R$1,500, in addition to a food parcel and fringe benefits such as health and dental care, attendance bonuses, etc., which vary. In general, most representatives of the companies interviewed pointed to the successes and reiterated their willingness to maintain the partnership. In addition, it is important to note that companies have not received any labor complaints from Venezuelan migrants and refugees in the past.

Most Venezuelans were hired by industrial companies, especially in the animal food and furniture industries. In general, nationality was not a determining factor in the quality of the workforce, but there was a correlation between the suitability of the professional and the assertiveness in the selection of profiles for jobs, as well as the individual resilience and willingness of each worker to stay in the job, which is independent of the workers’ country of origin.

While there are situations in which the company dismisses the worker for poor performance - or for other reasons - there are also cases in which the workers themselves decide whether to stay in the job. This decision is generally related to the difficulty of paying the rent when the support from AVSI Brasil ends.

Overall, interviewees see the interiorization of Venezuelan refugees and migrants as a win-win relationship for all parties: Migrants, companies, and civil society organizations. For companies, the greatest benefit is filling hard-to-fill positions that are essential to production operations. Interviewees report many positive attributes of Venezuelan migrants and refugees - they generally consider them to be educated, intelligent, skilled, communicative, and with great potential for permanence and career advancement. In addition, they are self-reliant, proactive, and resilient because of their life histories and their search for better living conditions. They describe most of them as willing to work and good at seizing opportunities.

However, there is a pattern of complaints that recur in HR departments, particularly complaints of excessive excused absenteeism, one of the most common reasons for not being hired after the 90-day probationary period. Workers state that the absences are due to health problems, although in many cases no documentation is provided to support this. And even absences that can be excused by medical certificates are considered excessive from the perspective of the company’s HR departments. Although such absences also occur among workers of other nationalities - especially in the animal-agricultural industry - company representatives point out that they are more common among Venezuelan migrants. Another recurring complaint is tardiness. Failure to adhere to schedules is a constant in company reports - since they work in shifts, any lateness undermines the productive framework.

Absences and tardiness combined with other issues, such as an apparent lack of motivation to take on greater responsibilities, lead employers to believe that these employees lack commitment to their work. In addition, insiders are reported to have difficulty recognizing hierarchies and chains of authority and responsibility, especially among workers with higher education, experience, and qualifications. It is important to note that the complaints mostly affect younger workers who have not yet had time to fully settle into a work routine (or, in other words, who have not yet acquired a work ethos that would guide their behavior in the work environment).

The way Venezuelan workers enter and settle into these companies is generally the same: they are employed in entry-level positions, in more operational roles that require fewer professional skills. In all the companies surveyed, Venezuelan migrants and refugees make up a portion of the foreign workforce, indicating that these companies tend to accept emplo-
Of the four companies that hired Venezuelan migrants and refugees through the Welcomed through work project, three indicated that they would like to continue their partnership with the project. They emphasized that the experience was extremely positive for the company and the work environment, and that hiring for a larger number of positions is a difficult process - companies do not always meet the required hiring goals.

One of the recruiters particularly highlighted the social support that the Welcomed through work project provides during the first three months of the probationary period. They consider it fundamental to ensure that the adjustment needs and requirements of new employees are not the responsibility of the company’s HR departments.

In contrast, the representative of the fourth company interviewed for this project was cautious about plans for further partnership with AVSI Brasil. She pointed out that the company could easily hire Venezuelans who have already settled in the region and join their families or those of friends once interiorized as part of family or reunions. In her opinion, it is more interesting for the company to hire these migrants who have already settled in the region, since they do not need any special assistance, such as registering their children in a daycare center or school, to name a few examples. In this sense, entering the company is like any other Brazilian applying for a job.

The quantitative survey was administered to a sample of 564 Venezuelan migrants and refugees, each of whom attended an average of 1.7 courses. Four qualitative interviews were conducted, two with professionals from AVSI Brasil responsible for the logistical structure and two with instructors responsible for teaching the vocational preparation course and the Portuguese course.

The estimated confidence level of this survey is 95%, with a maximum margin of error of plus/minus 6 percentage points. The surveys were conducted in Spanish in a virtual environment by a trained team of the Venezuelan researchers living in Brazil.
PROFILE OF THE RESPONDENTS

Of the Venezuelan migrants and refugees who participated in the courses offered by AVSI Brasil in the shelters, most (50.5%) have been in Brazil for 7 to 12 months; 20.2% have been in Brazil for more than 24 months; 8.3% have been in Brazil for 19 to 24 months; and 6.4% have been in Brazil for 13 to 18 months. The distribution mode of time in months spent in Brazil by participants is eight months, which corresponds to one third of the sample (32.1%).

Age and sex

The age group that most frequently attended the Portuguese and vocational training courses offered by AVSI Brasil in the shelters is between 25 and 49 years old, representing 70.7% of the respondents.

Family arrangement and family density

36.7% of the respondents live in a family with only one parent, 34.9% in a family with two parents, 22.9% are single and 5.5% live in a couple relationship without children. It is noteworthy that 50.7% of women live in single-parent families.

Education

Course participants with up to a high school education, without vocational training or higher education, represent the majority of respondents, 69.7% of the sample. Only 12.8% have attended college, and 1.8% have a graduate degree. 56.2% of the beneficiary women have attended high school.

All respondents with vocational education (high school with integrated or higher education) and university education show great flexibility to work in different fields. In total, respondents mentioned 55 different fields in which they had worked, which were different from their education. This means that each participant in this study had an average of 1.7 jobs outside of their field of study.

Of the participants without vocational training or higher education, the majority had work experience, with an average of two or three jobs. The group of 76 individuals reported 182 previous occupations. The most frequently cited occupations were food service, sales, maintenance/cleaning, bricklaying, sewing, public services, beauty salons (hairdresser, manicurist, makeup artist), retail, and domestic services. They reported a wide range of experiences.

Family income

In 76.1% of the course participants' families, no person was employed at the time of the survey. In the 23.9% of families in which at least one person had a paid job, the average labor income was 680 reais. In the 37.6% of families that received labor income and/or social benefits from the Brazilian state, the average monthly per capita income was 199 reais. With this income, the daily value per person was 6.6 reais, below the threshold of extreme poverty, which the World Bank defines as living on less than $1.9 per day.

Outcomes

Of all the courses offered, Portuguese was the most popular: 65.1% (n=71) took it; 44% (n=48) of the sample respondents took the “vocational Training” course; 30.3% (n=33) took the “Cashier” course; 16.3% (n=18) took the “Sales” course; and 12.8% (n=14) took the “Manicure, Hair Removal and Hair Care” course.

The multivariate analysis showed that the evaluation of the Portuguese course was quite positive on the following axes:

The fifth axis, “self-assessment of learning,” was positively evaluated by 91.6% of the respondents, with 26.8% rating it as excellent and 64.8% as good.
However, it is notable that the time participants have already spent in Brazil and their learning pace in Portuguese courses are interrelated, i.e., the longer they stay in the country, the more they learn. Therefore, they should continue learning and the course should also be offered to migrants and refugees who have been in the country longer, because they can learn and benefit even more, which is extremely important for their integration into society and inclusion in the labor market.

Principal Component Analysis (PCA) was used to create a summary factor from the four variables of Portuguese language skills - expression, comprehension, reading and writing - which was also transformed into an increasing ordinal scale from 0 to 10. Considering the four skills, respondents’ Portuguese proficiency remains low, with an average score of 4 points and a median score of 4.4 points. Proficiency in Portuguese is essential for building relationships, so improving this skill increases Venezuelan refugees’ and migrants’ opportunities for greater social capital.

In general, respondents positively evaluated the vocational preparation course, which covers labor law and cultural aspects of relationships in society and in the workplace. 81.3% rated it as important for placement in the labor market, and 95.8% rated the instructors as “excellent.” However, in the self-assessment of learning cultural aspects in labor relations, the performance is slightly lower (46.8%). All training courses were also rated well, as shown in the following charts (average scores for each attribute on the Likert scale, ascending from 1 to 5).
5. CHALLENGES AND RECOMMENDATIONS

THE OBJECTIVE OF THIS STUDY WAS NOT ONLY TO EVALUATE THE PROJECT’S RESULTS ACCORDING TO ITS LOGICAL FRAMEWORK, BUT ALSO TO MEASURE THE IMPACT ON THE BENEFICIARIES AND TO IDENTIFY STRATEGIES THAT SUPPORT THE ACHIEVEMENT OF AUTONOMY AND SOCIOECONOMIC INTEGRATION OF VENEZUELAN MIGRANTS AND REFUGEES IN BRAZIL.

The data obtained made it possible to verify the undeniable progress in the lives of Venezuelan migrants and refugees interiorized through the Welcomed through work project. By analyzing this progress in relation to the dimensions of economy, fundamental rights and social capital, we can draw several important conclusions. First, it can be confirmed that the living conditions of Venezuelans are better at P2 than at P0. Second, through a linear regression analysis that isolates the influence of income on the interiorization process, it becomes clear that if autonomy and integration are the desired goals for this population, the strategy is the right one.
The study also shows that Portuguese proficiency is high among Venezuelans starting from zero in the Portuguese courses offered by the project, and even higher in Roraima among those who have been in the country longer. In this sense, language courses should also be offered and continued for Venezuelan migrants and refugees who have lived in Brazil for longer, as language skills are essential for building social capital and for inclusion in the workforce and integration into society. However, despite the positive results, the implementation of the project since 2019 is not without challenges. However, despite the positive results, the implementation of the project since 2019 is not without challenges. The recruitment process of Venezuelan migrants and refugees for jobs in the private sector is a critical moment for the success of the Welcomed through work project. If the profile of the worker does not match the job, there is a high risk of failure. This type of frustration affects not only the project, but also - and especially - the Venezuelan beneficiaries, who are no longer in the care of Operation Welcome and are far from their home country. Therefore, it is recommended to apply stricter protocols in the selection of applicants who will be referred to the companies. In addition, it is necessary to inform the partner companies about the basic pillars of the Welcomed through work project’s methodology. Regarding the hiring process, it is important to clarify that AVSI Brasil pre-selects Venezuelan candidates who are interested in the positions offered by partner companies. Only then will they be hired if they are selected and accept the positions. The identification of the profiles takes place in the shelters managed by AVSI Brasil in Boa Vista (RR). Although the hiring process is the responsibility of the companies, a well-executed pre-selection process increases the chances of successful hiring. It is well known that the level of rigor of companies’ hiring processes can vary greatly. Regardless of how companies select candidates, the success or failure of each hire is shared by the company and the project. Therefore, it is strongly recommended to establish better protocols for the placement of Venezuelan applicants with partner companies. However, another difficulty must be considered: Venezuelan migrants and refugees in Boa Vista who are willing to relocate from the border region with Venezuela are usually very eager to secure any job opportunity. In this context, there are people who sometimes hide or pretend not to have certain negative traits that could jeopardize their placement.

The Selection Process of Venezuelan Refugees and Migrants for Jobs Offered by the Private Sector is a Critical and Particularly Important Moment for the Success of the Welcomed Through Work Project: If the Profile of the Worker is Not Suitable for the Task, the Probability of Failure is High.

For the partner companies, it is important to adopt a didactic approach to the pillars of the project methodology, including a report on the previous experience, presenting the strong and problematic points, especially in relation to the solid social support that AVSI Brasil provides to avoid potential victimization of the hired Venezuelans. The principle of the project is to empower vulnerable families to achieve autonomy and better living conditions through work.

Structured and regular monitoring of the hiring companies’ experience during the probationary period - if possible, up to six months after the interiorization of the hired Venezuelans - should be part of the project’s protocols. By monitoring not only the interiorized migrants and refugees, but also the companies, through a brief survey, AVSI Brasil can identify situations requiring emergency measures or medium- and long-term strategies. Nevertheless, there is a great idealization of the project among migrants and refugees waiting for interiorization in Boa Vista, which also indicates that their expectations need to be adjusted.

50.9% of respondents indicated that they have high expectations of the interiorization program and believe they can achieve financial autonomy in three months or less. The qualitative data shows that the ability to pay rent is the first...
aspect that affects a person’s permanence in the job. After the social assistance provided by the project ends, rent becomes a difficult burden for the family budget to bear, even if the project tries to find rental options compatible with projections of the family’s future labor income. In households where only one person works, it is not always possible to find properties in host cities that are compatible with their finances. Even when they do find one, Venezuelans are often discriminated against by landlords and real estate agents. Therefore, some Venezuelans relocated through the project seek other job opportunities in cities where they have family members or people nearby with whom they can share a house. In this way, in order to afford their basic expenses, they sacrifice their privacy. The second reason why some Venezuelans, especially the more educated ones, do not stay in the first job after interiorization, is that they search for jobs that offer better earning opportunities and are more compatible with their intellectual abilities.

Therefore, on the one hand, it is recommended to level these realistic expectations about the interiorization process and the project, reiterate the need for family and financial planning, and provide clarity about communicating the responsibilities that beneficiaries will have to assume in the host city. On the other hand, whenever possible, it is recommended to promote the employability of another family member at the time of selection in Boa Vista or from the time the group arrives in their new home and city.

Finally, xenophobia is always present, even if it manifests itself in different and subtle ways. Starting in Roraima, sheltered Venezuelans migrants and refugees experience discrimination and exploitation when, in their desperation for income, they are more likely to accept lower pay than Brazilians, even when performing the same tasks. They are also more likely than Brazilians to take informal jobs. In host cities, after interiorization through the project, discrimination is evident in property owners’ refusal to rent and their intolerance of behaviors deemed inappropriate (loud music, parties, and disregard for social distancing), and in schools that are not always open to enrolling Venezuelan children.
welcomed
through work

AVSI Brasil • Brasília Office
SRTVS, Quadra 701, Bloco O
sala 536, 5º andar, Ed. Multiempresarial
CEP 70340-000 • Brasília/DF
(61) 3081.0858
acolhidos@avsi.org.br

AVSI Brasil • Head Office
Rua Frederico Simões, 98
13º andar, Ed. Advanced Trade
Caminho das Árvores
CEP 41820-774 • Salvador/BA
(71) 3555.3355
@avsibrasil
www.avsibrasil.org.br